

Benchmarking Analysis of Hangar Lease Rates



Newport News/Williamsburg International Airport (PHF) Final Report

May 21, 2020



NOTICE OF CONFIDENTIALITY

The content of the present report is private and confidential and cannot be reproduced, in full or in part, except with the consent of the Peninsula Airport Commission (PAC). The recipient promises to preserve the confidential nature of the information contained in the present document and will take all necessary actions to prevent non-authorized copying, divulgation or transmission, in part or in full, of this information to unintended parties.

The recipient also promises not to use, modify, translate, adapt, convert or exploit the content of the present document without written consent from the Peninsula Airport Commission.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| 1. | Introduction 1 | | | | | |
|----|----------------|--|-----|--|--|--|
| 2. | Metho | odology | . 2 | | | |
| 3. | Bench | nmarking Results & Analysis | . 3 | | | |
| 3 | 3.1 | Benchmarked Airports | . 3 | | | |
| 3 | 3.2 | Hangar Lease Rates at PHF Situation | . 3 | | | |
| 3 | 3.3 | Hangar leasing rates at benchmarked Airports | . 6 | | | |
| 3 | 3.4 | Lease Terms and Conditions | . 9 | | | |
| 3 | 3.5 | Other Information on Hangar Leasing | 10 | | | |
| 3 | 3.6 | Land Lease Rate, Landing Fees and Parking Fees | .11 | | | |
| 4. | Concl | usion | .12 | | | |

TABLE OF TABLES

| Table 1 - Benchmarked Airports | . 3 |
|---|-----|
| Table 2 - Inventory of the GA Hangars at PHF | |
| Table 3 - Overview of the Hangar Lease Rates | . 6 |
| Table 4 - Hangar Lease Terms & Conditions | |
| Table 5 - Overview of the Land Lease Rates, Landing Fees and Parking Fees | |
| | |

TABLE OF FIGURES

| Figure 1 - Map of the GA Hangar Zone (Exhibit A). | |
|---|--|
|---|--|

1. Introduction

In the last few months, the Newport News Williamsburg International Airport (PHF) has been reviewed its hangar leasing rate for General Aviation (GA) tenants. Historically, PHF has been face with a large discrepancy in hangar leasing rates. In some cases, fees are very far from the FAA recommended market average.

This situation raises grant assurance issues for PHF. Aa a federally obligated airport PHF must abide by their grant assurances. Today GA hangar leasing rates range from \$0.06 per square foot to \$0.42 per square foot. A significant number of ground leases were not adjusted years ago when hangars were reverted back to the airport. The airport authority also has a fair number of month to month leases since renewals were not done. PHF has conducted a first assessment of fair market rate and results are pointing towards high rate increases for many tenants.

To obtain comparable, PHF has asked Explorer Solutions to conduct a benchmarking analysis of general aviation hangar leasing rates at airports of similar size and nature. The study focuses on General Aviation fees (hangar, ground, sub-leases, office space). The objective of the mandate is to gather industry data that will help align its rates with the market and industry best practices.

2. Methodology

Prior to the launch meeting, Explorer Solutions reviewed a series of past reports and key airport information in order to obtain a complete understanding of the current situation. The consultant also prepared a preliminary list of eight (8) airports to contact as part of the benchmarking analysis. These airports were selected based on their geographical location, their range of services (commercial services versus general aviation only) and the regional population. A list of questions / topics was also prepared by the consultant prior to the launch meeting.

The launch meeting occurred on March 2nd 2020. The main objective of the meeting was to review the list of targets, the questions and to understand the current situation at the airport in regards to the GA hangar tenants. On the same day, Explorer Solutions began to phone airport managers to gather the required information. The project team conducted interviews until March 12, 2020. The draft report for this mandate was realized in two (2) weeks. For the final report, the objective will be to provide the information for all studied airports (if possible).



3. Benchmarking Results & Analysis

3.1 Benchmarked Airports

Before presenting the results of the benchmarking exercise, this first section presents the airports that were selected and interviewed. Table 1 provides details on the state, the type of airport (commercial services vs. general aviation), the main runway length, the annual number of passengers and the regional population. Among the benchmarked airports, only two (2) are not offering commercial services (Chesterfield and Hanover).

Half of the selected airports are located in the State of Virginia (total of 4), three (3) in North Carolina and one (1) in West Virginia (Charleston). Among the benchmarked airport, Raleigh-Durham International has significantly more passengers compared to other commercial airports.

| Airport | Code | State | Туре | Main Runway Length | Passengers (annual) | Regional Population |
|------------------------------|------|-------|------|-----------------------|------------------------|------------------------|
| Norfolk International | ORF | VA | CS | 05/23 - 9001 x 150 | 3,200,000 | 500,000 |
| Richmond International | RIC | VA | CS | 16/34 - 9003 x 150 | 4,379,660 | 1,260,000 |
| Pitt-Greenville | PGV | NC | CS | 02/20 - 7175 x 150 | 106,000 | 180,000 |
| Raleigh-Durham International | RDU | NC | CS | 05L/23R - 10000 x 150 | 14,218,000 | 1,400,000 |
| Piedmont-Triad International | GSO | NC | CS | 05L/23R - 9000 x 150 | 1,078,247 | 533,627 |
| Charleston International | CHS | WV | CS | 03/21 - 7000 x 150 | 3,987,756 | 193,067 |
| Chesterfield Airport | FCI | VA | GA | 15/33 - 5500 x 150 | N/A | 343,599 |
| Hanover County Airport | OFP | VA | GA | 16/34 - 5402 x 150 | N/A | 106,374 |
| Newport News | PHF | VA | CS | 07/25 - 8033 x 150 | 403,000 | 601,000* |

Table 1 - Benchmarked Airports

*Includes PHF's primary catchment area: City of Newport News (180K); City of Hampton (136K); City of Poquoson (12K); City of Williamsburg (15K); County of York (68K); County of James City (75K); City of Gloucester (30K) and City of Suffolk (85K).

3.2 Hangar Lease Rates at PHF Situation

This section presents an inventory of the various type of GA hangars owned by PHF and their associated lease rates.

Figure 1 provides an overview of the general aviation sector of the airport. At the moment, PHF has a somewhat complex approach to defining hangar leasing rates due to the fact that many hangars have dissimilar characteristics and particularities. Historically, there was no defined hangar construction guidelines and standard at the Airport. To mitigate this variety the airport historically applies factors to each tenant based on the characteristics of the hangar and its environment.

Figure 1 - Map of the GA Hangar Zone (Exhibit A)



In table 2 you will find the current portrait of the GA hangars rates at PHF. The airport authority considers four (4) types or categories of GA hangars, each with their own characteristics, dimensions and lease rates. It is important to highlight that there is good standardization in place for T-Hangars (older of newer) compared to portable hangars that can drastically change in terms of size, characteristics and lease rates. PHF has a total of 39 GA hangar. 77% of them are T-Hangars.

| Categories of hangars | Hangar Number | Characteristics* | Size | Current Lease Rates (monthly) | New Lease Rates (monthly) |
|--------------------------|------------------|--|---|---|--|
| Older T-Hangars | 1B - 10B | Manual doors and single power outlet. | All 10 hangars have a size of 712 sq. ft. | \$0.35 / sq. ft. | \$0.39 / sq. ft. (+11%) |
| Newer T-Hangars | 11B - 30B | Power bi-fold doors, includes access door, power and overhead lights. | All 20 hangars have a size of 1,098 sq. ft. | \$0.36 / sq. ft. | \$0.45 / sq. ft. (+24%) |
| Portable Hangars | 6A, 19A, 20A | Various features: power vs. manual doors, access door, overhead lighting, etc. | 6A: 1,680 sq. ft. 19A: 1,317 sq. ft. 20A: 1,023 sq. ft. | 6A: \$0.18 / sq. ft. 19A: \$0.23 / sq. ft. 20A: \$0.22 / sq. ft. | 6A: \$0.42 / sq. ft. (+135%) 19A: \$0.45 / sq. ft. (+98%) 20A: \$0.39 / sq. ft. (+74%) |
| Portable Hangars | 9A -14A | Various features: Identical to portable hangars. | 9A-10A-11A: 762 sq. ft. 14A-13A-12A: 1,000 sq. ft. | 9A: \$0.13 / sq. ft. 10A: \$0.14 / sq. ft. 11A: \$0.18 / sq. ft. 12A: \$0.18 / sq. ft. 13A: \$0.13 / sq. ft. 14A: \$0.10 / sq. ft. | 9A: \$0.39 / sq. ft. (+210%) 10A: \$0.33 / sq. ft. (+141%) 11A: \$0.33 / sq. ft. (+86%) 12A: \$0.33 / sq. ft. (+80%) 13A: \$0.33 / sq. ft. (149%) 14A: \$0.33 / sq. ft. (+244%) |

Table 2 - Inventory of the GA Hangars at PHF

*Typical characteristics, may vary for some hangars other than the T-Hangars.

Note: PHF has some corporate tenants that are renting hangar space. Their monthly lease rates range between \$0.80 per sq. ft. and \$1.13 per sq. ft.

3.3 Hangar leasing rates at benchmarked Airports

Table 3 offers an overview of the Hangar Lease Rates of the benchmarked airports. Among the key highlights, we see that many airports place the management of GA tenants in the hands of local FBOs. In fact, Norfolk Int'l, Piedmont-Triad Int'l and Charleston Int'l have FBOs in charge of these tenants (more than a third of the respondents).

This reality tends to augment as airports experience a higher and growing number of commercial passengers. Due to their GA positioning, Chesterfield and Hanover Airports have more GA hangars on-site. Some other airports, like Charleston Int'I, have smaller GA airports in their area that are specifically dedicated to this clientele.

Definitions: In this study, the difference between a Box Hangar and a Corporate Hangar is that the second will have more amenities and will typically serve a corporate clientele. These hangars have office space, a kitchen, bathrooms (toilet and shower) and other similar amenities. Therefore, the building size should not affect the categorization. Box hangars typically serve private pilot and the building may only include office space and a bathroom.

| Airport | Inventory of Airport Owned GA Hangars | Hangar Lease Rate | |
|---------------------------------|--|--|--|
| Norfolk International | The FBO manages most hangars. | The FBO declined to provide rates and information. | |
| Richmond International | Richmond owns 4 corporate hangars. There is no T-Hangar or Portable Hangar at the airport. | Did not answer. | |
| Pitt-Greenville | Declined to participate | Declined to participate | |
| Raleigh-Durham International | The Airport owns: 60 T-Hangars (800 sq. ft.) with electricity, but not heated. One shared toilet per building. 80 portables hangars with electricity only. These hangars are older than the T-Hangars. Here are the various dimensions: Small: Unknown Medium: 1,000 sq. ft. Large: 1,800 sq. ft. 5 corporate hangars The Airport also owns an office building. | T-Hangar: \$240 / month (\$0.30 / sq. ft. / month) Portables: Small: \$110 / month Medium: \$124 / month (\$0.124 / sq. ft. / month) Large: \$135 to \$151 / month (between \$0.075 and \$0.084 / sq. ft. / month) Corporate: Hangar \$9.21 sq. ft. (annual) Office Space in the hangar is at \$10.93 sq. ft. (annual) Ramp space: \$0.2439 sq. ft. (annual) Vehicle parking: \$0.2270 sq. ft. (annual) Grounds/Landscaping: \$0.23 sq. ft. (annual) Office Building (GA terminal): To FBO: Office at \$13.40 sq. ft. (annual) FBO Office sub-lease at \$33.05 sq. ft. (annual) Vehicle parking: \$0.2525 sq. ft. (annual) | |
| Piedmont-Triad International | Piedmont-Triad owns some GA hangar, but they are all managed by the FBO. | The FBO declined to provide rates and information. | |
| | | | |

Table 3 - Overview of the Hangar Lease Rates

| Atumont | Inventory of Airport Owned CA Henrice | Henney Loose Dete |
|--------------------------|---|---|
| Airport | Inventory of Airport Owned GA Hangars | Hangar Lease Rate |
| Charleston International | Charleston does not own any GA hangar. The FBOs have GA hangars. FBO no. 1: 1 large (23,000 sq. ft.) heated box hangar with no office space. The hangar hosts multiple aircraft from small piston to larger jet aircrafts. The building has 4 storage rooms in the back. FBO no. 2: Refused to share the information. FBO no. 3: Mount Pleasant Airport is the GA airport of the region and is managed by the same authority has Charleston Int'l. They own 4 bays in a 10- bay building (total surface of 11,883 sq. ft., so 1,188 sq. ft. per bay). Due to their size, these T- Hangars can be considered has large T- | FBO no. 1 (Charleston): Large heated box hangar (23,000 sq. ft.): \$0.10 sq. ft. per month. This type of hangar cannot be compared to anything similar at PHF (at least for the GA clientele). Mount Pleasant Airport: Non-heated T-Hangar: \$0.378 per sq. ft. per month (\$450 per month). FBO no. 2: Refused to share the information. |
| | Hangars. | |
| Chesterfield Airport | The airport owns a total of 110 GA hangars: 100 standard T-Hangars (non-heated) with sizes ranging from 1,039 sq. ft. to 1,091 sq. ft. (average of 1,065 sq. ft.). 10 large T-Hangars (non-heated) with a size of 1,720 sq. ft. | Standard T-Hangar: \$288.75 per month or \$0.2711 per sq. ft. per month. Large T-Hangar: \$420.00 per month or \$0.2442 per sq. ft. per month. |
| Hanover County Airport | Hanover owns various types of hangars: 52 T-Hangars (newer) all have electric bifold doors (42' doors) and electric lights and outlets (electric included in rent). 12 units have 14' doors, the rest has 12'2 by 50-foot-wide end pods with electric bifold (50' doors) and electric lights and outlets (electric included in rent). Each bay has 1,500 sq. ft. 2 large box hangars (10,000 sq. ft.) with electricity and hydro. 4 small box hangars (4,000 sq. ft.) with electricity and hydro) 4 corporate hangars. The west side 10,000 sf hangar mentioned is gas heated with electric powered hydroswing 80 foot by 20' 1-piece door (electric included). The west side 4,800 sf corporate hangar is gas heated with electric powered hydroswing 60 foot by 20' 1-piece door (electric included). 1 maintenance hangar (3,000 sq. ft.) with gas heat and electric lights and 60-foot hydroswing door attached 2 portable hangars are privately-owned. | T-Hangar: \$360 per month (\$0.24 / sq. ft. / month) for both types of doors. Large Box Hangar: N/A Small Box Hangar: \$736 per month Corporate hangar: Variable, multiples tenants and managed by the FBO. Maintenance hangar: Not provided (confidential) |
| Nowport Nove | | hongor |
| Newport News | Please refer to Table 2 for details by category of | nangar. |

Based on the information obtain so far, we can provide the following takeaways:

> T-Hangars:

- Standard T-Hangars (non-heated) vary between \$240, \$288 and \$360 per month compared to the current rate of \$250 per month at PHF and a proposed increase to \$278 per month. Based on this partial information, we can affirm that PHF propose rates in the industry average.
- Large T-Hangars (non-heated) vary between \$420 and \$450 per month compared to the current rate of \$400 per month at PHF and a proposed increase at \$494 per month. Based on this information, we can affirm that PHF is about 10% above the industry average.

> Portable Hangars:

- Only Raleigh has Portable Hangars. Depending on their size, they vary from \$110 to \$151 per month. For PHF, Portable Hangars currently vary between \$96 and \$300 per month, but the average of the nine (9) Portable Hangars is \$175.14 per month, which is close to the numbers provided by Raleigh. On the other hand, the new proposed rates vary between \$251 and \$706 per month (average of \$387), which is significantly higher than Raleigh.
- The lack of details on the characteristics of the Portable Hangars at Raleigh affects the current validity of the analysis.

Box Hangars:

 Hanover County has box hangars at \$736 per month. Also, the FBO at Charleston has a large 23,000 sq. ft. box hangar that host multiple tenants.

3.4 Lease Terms and Conditions

Benchmarked airports also shared some information of the hangar lease terms and conditions. Table 4 presents that information plus the current occupancy rate for each airport. The key takeaways are the following:

- > Most airports typically have lease terms of 2 to 5 years, or are on a month to month basis.
- For the annual rate increase, methodologies vary. Raleigh and Charleston applied an annual 3% increase while Mount Pleasant and Chesterfield have no annual lease rate increase.
- > Typically, airport authorities are responsible of hangar structural maintenance costs while tenants are responsible of other maintenance costs.
- > At most airport, the occupancy rate is at or close to 100%.

| Airport | Terms and Conditions | Occupancy Rate | |
|--------------------------|--|---|---------------------------------|
| Raleigh-Durham | Lease Terms: Typically, 20-year contracts | 100% | Commented [ÉL1]: For corporate? |
| International | CPI: 3% annual lease rate increase | 100 // | |
| Charleston International | Mount Pleasant Airport: Lease Terms: Typically, 3-year contracts. CPI: Quite stable in the past 10 years, no annual increase. Other Costs: The airport pays for the structural maintenance; the rest is the responsibility of the tenant. FBO: Lease Terms: 1- or 2-years contracts. CPI: 3% per year. Other Costs: The tenants need to pay a maintenance fee. | All GA hangars are full at each of their three (3) airports, including Mount Pleasant and Charleston. | |
| Chesterfield Airport | Lease Terms: Month to month with a 30-day notice requirement. CPI: No annual increase. Other Costs: The airport is owned by Chesterfield County, and the county pays for all maintenance on county-owned hangars. | 7 standard T-Hangars are currently available (93.6% occupancy) | |
| Hanover County Airport | Lease Terms: Variable for T-Hangar and Box Hangars. Corporate leases are 20 years plus possible 5 years extensions. CPI: Not applicable for T-Hangars and Box Hangars, but a 3% annual increase is applied to corporate tenants. Other Costs: Based on the information shared by the airport, there is no extra maintenance fee. | 100% for all types of airport-owned hangars | |
| Newport News | Lease Terms: Variable depending the type of hangar. Portable hangars vary from month to month agreement and year to year agreement. T-Hangars have 1-year terms. Average Lease Duration: 8.6 years for older T-Hangars, 8.5 years for newer T-Hangars, 8.1 years for all | 100% | |

Table 4 - Hangar Lease Terms & Conditions

| Airport | Terms and Conditions | Occupancy Rate |
|---------|--|----------------|
| | categories or Portable Hangars and 19.5 years for Box Hangars. CPI : Historically, no annual increase for GA tenants. | |

Additional comments from Hanover County Airport: Since the FBO provides all the airport maintenance fees to include grass mowing of runway, taxiway and safety zones (basically everything inside the fence), snow removal, ditch line clearing, electric light bulb replacements and terminal/facility cleaning, it is hard to place an accurate square footage cost since it is not a strict building lease.

3.5 Other Information on Hangar Leasing

In addition to the previous section, the project team tried to understand the particularities that applied to FBOs. The following information gives an overview of the current situation at PHF:

Atlantic Aviation:

- Atlantic Aviation FBO agreement for Hangar 1 and 2 includes multiple components including land rent, facility rent, and fuel flowage fees. PHF is currently appraising the facilities for market rent. Hangar 3 adjusts by 5% every 5 years and is currently \$8,268.75.
 - Lease (Hangar 1): 11,760 sq. ft. (facility rent)
 - Lease (Hangar 2): 15,200 sq. ft. (facility rent)
 - Lease (Hangar 3): 15,600 sq. ft. (facility rent)

Rick's Aviation:

- Rick's Aviation has numerous facilities associated with their FBO agreement which are currently under land rent (Aery and Flight School hangars) and includes 2% gross receipts and fuel flowage fees. Hangar 21A, 25A, and 27A should be facility rent.
 - Lease (Aery): 6,000 sq. ft. (land rent)
 - Lease (Hangar 21A): 3,200 sq. ft. (facility rent)
 - Lease (Hangar 25A): 3,000 sq. ft. (facility rent)
 - Lease (Hangar 27A): 5,772 sq. ft. (facility rent)
 - Lease (Flight School): 15,500 sq. ft. (land rent)

At this time, few FBO-related information is available. The following bullet points present the information shared by some of the benchmarked airports:

- <u>Raleigh-Durham International</u>: At their airport, the FBOs are paying \$10.23 per sq. ft. per annum for the hangar and an additional \$0.41 per sq. ft. per annum for the ramp space.
- <u>Hanover County International</u>: The current FBO rents its hangar for the amount of \$17,105 per month. There is a new 11,875 sq. ft. FBO hangar in construction. The airport does not receive other type of revenues from the FBO except the hangar lease. In the future, new lease agreement calls for fuel flowage fee and percentage of hangar rents.

None of the benchmarked airports applies an Airport Field Permit. During discussions with airport managers, they mentioned that this approach can be interesting and less complicated to manage on a day-to-day basis, but it needs to be fair for all GA tenants. PHF considers the implementation of an Airport Field Permit based on the aircraft weight (\$20.00 per 1,000 lb. (MGLW)). This element cannot be compared as part of this study.

3.6 Land Lease Rate, Landing Fees and Parking Fees

This last segment of the benchmarking analysis covers other GA fees (landing and parking fees) and the land lease rate for each studied airport. Table 5 presents the information that Explorer Solutions was able to obtain on those topics. We can note the following takeaways:

- Most airport do not charge landing fees to the GA clientele (or waive the fee with fuel flowage);
- > At the moment, only Chesterfield applies small aircraft parking fees;
- Based on the available information, the land lease at PHF is higher than Raleigh-Durham and Piedmont-Triad (2 or 3 times higher).
- Based on practices at Raleigh and Richmond, we observe that landing fees and parking fees are sometimes managed by FBOs. This removes a workload to the airport. Instead, these airports will get a lease fee for the ramp space (parking) and a small royalty on landing fees (if applicable).

| Airport | Land Lease Rate | Landing Fees | Parking Fees |
|---------------------------------|---|---|--|
| Richmond International | \$0.27 / sq. ft. | Managed by the FBO. | Managed by the FBO. |
| Raleigh-Durham International | Overall land lease rate is \$1.06 / sq. ft. (annual) or \$0.0883 / sq. ft. per month. | Managed by the FBO. Waived with fuel flowage. | Managed by the FBO. |
| Piedmont-Triad International | Maintenance company at the airport (own 5 hangars): between \$0.10 - \$0.15 / sq. ft. per month. | Waived in 99,9% of the time (for GA) due to the Fuel Flowage. They get paid by the FBO \$0.0567 per gallon. | Did not provide |
| Charleston International | The land lease is equal to 12.35% of the property value. The contracts are typically for a 20-year period. They can increase the rate every 5 years (cap at 40% increase). The FBOs do not own land. | No landing fees for GA tenants or visitors. They want to change that and eventually charge a fee. | Don't have them in hand, they have the info in a document. |
| Chesterfield Airport | No land lease for GA tenants. | No landing fees for GA. | Overnight: varies between \$5.50 (single engine) and \$20.50 (jet) Standard Tie Down: \$65 per month |
| Hanover County Airport | Approximatively \$0.46 per sq. ft. (or \$0.038 per month) | No landing fees for GA. | The tie-down fee charge is \$85 a month or \$7 per day for singles, \$15 per day for twins, \$100 per day for jets, and \$200 for large jets. |
| Newport News | At PHF, the land lease rate is \$0.31 per sq. ft. per month. Hangar 3A-10A-14A-28A are still under the original ground rent. | No landing fees for GA. Replaced by the Airport Field Permit. | No parking fees. |

Table 5 - Overview of the Land Lease Rates, Landing Fees and Parking Fees

Note: Richmond International makes a markup of \$0.06 per gallon of fuel sold by the FBO.

4. Conclusion / Recommendations

The benchmarking of general aviation fees and procedures at airports shows a number of variables. Initially we see that larger commercial air service airports tend to transfer GA management responsibilities to their local FBO. Such a decision positively reduces the volume of work required by airport staff to manage these tenants and users but in the end may also reduce revenues depending on the terms and conditions of the contract with the FBO. On the other hand, a pro-active FBO will generate more traffic which may help mitigate the loss of revenues. With the volume of passengers today at PHF, we recommend the Airport maintain control and leadership with the development of the GA sector and activities.

The notion of applying an Airport Field Permit was also discussed. Presently none of the benchmarked airports have such a permit in place but airport managers were very much responsive and interested in the concept as a way to reduce workload and variable in fees.

Overall, the present pricing/fee structure at PHF seems pretty similar to those seen elsewhere but the new proposed prices increases brings the fees a bit higher in some instances. Notwithstanding the price, we recommend PHF introduces an annual inflation rate increase to reflect the growing cost of living and associated airport refurbishment and development cost.

A standardisation is required at PHF and some form of catching up on fees that have not evolved in many years. Potentially the new fee schedule could be spread on a longer time frame.